# A bi-proportional method applied to the Spanish Congress

V. Ramírez\*, F. Pukelsheim\*\*, A. Palomares\*, J. Martínez\*.

Draft version 22 February 2008

\*University of Granada, Spain. \*\*University of Augsburg, Germany.

#### Abstract

A bi-proportional divisor method is applied to allocate the seats of the 2004 Spanish Congress, thus achieving proportionality relative to the population counts in the fifty-two provinces, as well as proportionality relative to the vote counts for the political parties. Also, advantages and disadvantages of the method are discussed.

**Keywords:** proportional allotment, bi-proportional allotment, BAZI

### 1 Introduction.

For the election of their national parliaments, many countries subdivide the grand electoral region into smaller electoral districts, and assign seats to parties separately in each district. The idea is to bring representatives nearer to the electors. However, experience shows that separate district apportionments generally do not entail an equitable overall representation of political parties. It may happen that the overall proportion of seats of a party significantly deviates from their overall proportion of votes, be it to their advantage or to their disadvantage. For example, this has been continuously happening to the IU-party in Spain, since their total number of deputies consistently

falls short of their proportional share of votes. The likelihood of such biases increases when there are many electoral districts that only have a small number of seats to fill.

In order to evade this problem, some countries have taken recourse to a mixed-member proportional system [10]. For instance, Germany elects 299 members of the Bundestag in single-seat districts. Yet the overall apportionment of the 598 regular Bundestag seats turns out to be very proportional. Here, proportionality applies to those parties that turn out to be eligible to participate in the apportionment process, that is, their vote share amounts to at least five-percent of the overall ballot count. In the German system proportionality is achieved by first allocating the 598 seats in proportion to the parties' vote counts. The seats that a party thus obtains are filled with this party's direct-seat winners, while the remaining seats are filled from this party's candidate list. A related proposal for the Spanish congress based on the vote total and seat total is discussed in [7], with the additional twist to reward big parties in order to improve upon governability.

In 1989 Balinski and Demange [2] proposed a bi-proportional apportionment method permitting a subdivision into several electoral districts, while at the same time securing overall proportionality with respect to vote counts. In [3] they propose an algorithm to obtain this bi-proportional apportionment solution. Other algorithms have been proposed by Pukelsheim and Ramírez. A total of thirteen algorithms is implemented in the software Bazi [9] that is made freely available by the Augsburg research group.

Section 2 explains the general idea underlying bi-proportional apportionment methods. In Section 3, we apply the bi-proportional divisor method with rounding down (Jefferson/D'Hondt/Hagenbach-Bischoff) to the 2004 election of the Spanish Congress. In our sample calculation, all valid votes are considered eligible to participate in the apportionment process. The final Section 4 discusses some advantages and disadvantages of the bi-proportional technique.

## 2 The bi-proportional method.

Suppose that the electoral region is subdivided into electoral districts i = 1, ..., k, with district magnitudes  $M_i$ . The district magnitude  $M_i$  signifies the number of seats to fill in district i. Furthermore we assume that there are parties  $j = 1, ..., \ell$  campaigning in the electoral region. We assume that

they are allocated  $P_j$  seats, in proportion to their overall vote totals. Clearly, the sum of the district magnitudes must be equal to the sum of the overall party seats,  $\sum_{i=1}^{k} M_i = \sum_{j=1}^{\ell} P_j = H$ , where H is the house size of the national parliament. Let  $v_{ij}$  be the number of votes obtained in district i by party j. A typical display of the data is shown in Table 1.

Overall party seats	1		j		$\ell$
District magnitudes	$P_1$		$P_j$		$P_{\ell}$
$1   M_1$	$v_{11}$ - $s_{11}$		$v_{1j}$ - $s_{1j}$		$v_{1\ell}$ - $s_{1\ell}$
i i	:	:	:	:	:
$i$ $M_i$	$v_{i1}$ - $s_{i1}$		$v_{ij}$ - $s_{ij}$		$v_{i\ell}$ - $s_{i\ell}$
:	:	:	:	:	:
$k$ $M_k$	$v_{k1}$ - $s_{k1}$		$v_{kj}$ - $s_{kj}$		$v_{k\ell}$ - $s_{k\ell}$

Table 1: Input data and output data. In district i = 1, ..., k with district magnitude  $M_i$ , party  $j = 1, ..., \ell$  with overall party seats  $P_j$  wins  $v_{ij}$  votes and gets  $s_{ij}$  seats.

The task is how to obtain the number of seats  $s_{ij}$ , to be allocated in district i to party j. Row sums and column sums are required to achieve the pre-specified district magnitudes and overall party seats. That is, the seat numbers in district i must add up to  $M_i$ , and the seat numbers for party j must add up to the overall party seats  $P_j$ .

The main issue is to determine the seat numbers  $s_{ij}$  in such a way that they turn out to be proportional, in some sense or other, to the vote counts  $v_{ij}$ . It may be tempting to scale the vote count  $v_{ij}$  by some common constant, and then round the resulting quotient to a neighboring integer. It turns out that this approach does not assure that the pre-specified row and column sums are met correctly. A single common constant for re-scaling the vote matrix is insufficient to achieve the desired goal.

Instead, the double proportional methods proposed by Balinski and Demange use two sets of constants, namely, district divisors and party divisors. The divisors are found by an iterative procedure. Once they are obtained, the seat apportionment matrix is most easily verified, by dividing the vote count  $v_{ij}$ , in district i of party j, by the corresponding district divisor and the corresponding party divisor. We take the space to demonstrate the approach

by example.

A three-district example. For the sake of simplicity we consider just three Spanish provinces with their actual district magnitudes for the Spanish Congress, Huesca with 3 deputies, Teruel with 3 deputies, and Zaragoza with 7 deputies. In line with the 2004 election we assume that the 13 seats are shared between three parties: PSOE 6, PP 5, and CHA 2.

Overall party seats	PSOE	PP	CHA
District magnitudes	6	5	2
Huesca 3	61 500	50 493	8 629
Teruel 3	36152	35 920	4463
Zaragoza 7	224776	198 480	81 160

Table 2: Votes in Aragón 2004. There are 13 seats to be apportioned, for a total of 701513 votes. Thus 61500 votes yield an initial weight of  $13 \times 61500/701513 = 1.140$ , for the first cell of Table 3.

Table 3 illustrates that individual rounding does not result in a valid seat apportionment. To this end we subdivide all vote counts by the vote total (701 573) and multiply by the seat total (13). This calculation results in a fractional number that must be rounded to an integer value before it can be interpreted as a number of seats. Table 3 applies standard rounding, wherein a fractional number gets rounded to the nearest integer. The resulting apportionment is infeasible. It sums to a total of 14 seats instead of 13. Huesca and Teruel each get only 2 seats instead of 3, while Zaragoza is assigned 10 seats instead of 7. The PP party is allocated 6 seats instead of 5.

Weights(0)			Roun	dings	
1.140	0.936	0.160	1	1	0
0.670	0.666	0.083	1	1	0
4.165	3.678	1.504	4	4	2

Table 3: Initial weights(0) and roundings from Table 2. Row sums fail to match the prespecified district magnitudes, and the second column sum fails to match the overall party seats.

Since scaling the weights with a single common constant turns out not to be feasible, we instead proceed somewhat more sensitively row by row. Thus the first row is scaled by 1.60, whence the new weights 1.823:1.497:0.256 round to 2:1:0 and achieve the pre-specified district magnitude, 3. The multiplier 1.60 is not unique; in fact, any number in the range from 1.32 to 1.60 would do. We choose the maximum multiplier whenever the weights have to be scaled up, and the minimum multiplier whenever they need to be scaled down. See Table 4.

Multipliers	Weights(1)	)		Roun	dings	
$\times 1.60 =$	1.823	1.497	0.256	2	1	0
$\times 2.25 =$	1.507	1.498	0.186	2	1	0
$\times 0.68 =$	2.832	2.501	1.023	3	3	1

Table 4: A first scaling. The rows of the weights(0) are scaled by the given multipliers, to obtain weights(1) and their roundings. Row sums match the district magnitudes, but column sums still miss the overall party seats.

The row-wise adjustments lead to an intermediate seat allocation obeying the pre-specified district magnitudes. But the overall party seats are not met: PSOE is awarded 7 seats instead of 6, and CHA gets 1 seat instead of 2. In order to correct the column sums, the weights(1) are column-wise re-scaled to obtain weights(2), and then rounded. The intermediate seat apportionment meets the overall party seats, but simultaneously creates a new imbalance between Teruel and Zaragoza. See Table 5.

Multipliers	$\times 0.89 =$	$\times 1 =$	$\times 1.95 =$			
	Weights(2	2)		Roun	dings	
	1.623	1.497	0.499	2	1	0
	1.341	1.498	0.364	1	1	0
	2.521	2.501	1.994	3	3	2

Table 5: A second scaling. The columns of the weights(1) are scaled by the given multipliers, to obtain weights(2) and their roundings. Column sums match the overall party seats, but the last two rows do not fit.

It transpires that another re-scaling of rows is needed to obtain the final result. By multiplying the second row by 1.1 and the third row by 0.995,

we obtain the weights(3) shown in Table 6. The rounding of these weights does indeed meet the pre-specified district magnitudes, as well as the overall party seats. Hence the rounded numbers in Table 6 constitute the seat apportionment of the bi-proportional divisor method with standard rounding.

Multipliers	Weights(3			Roun	dings	
	1.623	1.497	0.499	2	1	0
×1.1 =	1.476	1.647	0.399	1	2	0
$\times 0.995 =$	2.508	2.488	1.984	3	2	2

Table 6: A final scaling. Multiplying the last two rows of the weights(2) produces the weights(3). Since their roundings obey the prespecified marginals, they represent the end result.

In conclusion, the bi-proportional apportionment that goes along with the input data from Table 2 are displayed in Table 7 in a compact form documenting the input data as well as exhibiting the output data. The prespecified district magnitudes and overall party seats are printed in italics, to the left and at the top. The district divisors and the party divisors are also shown in italics, to the right and at the bottom. The divisors are not unique, but may vary in small intervals, as long as the resulting quotient rounds to the seat numbers given in Table 7. In contrast, the seat numbers themselves are uniquely determined: There is just one seat apportionment which can be obtained from the input vote counts by first re-scaling rows and columns and then rounding. Of course, we could have displayed Table 7 with showing multipliers instead of divisors. But in a practical problem, like the present one, large vote counts must be scaled down into small seat numbers. It is then more convenient to communicate divisors rather than multipliers.

It is remarkably simple to double check the seat apportionment displayed in Table 7. All a voter needs to do, is to sub-divide the success of his or her party in his or her district by the corresponding divisors and than round the resulting quotient to obtain the number of seats. For instance, those who vote for PSOE in Huesca find that their party has quotient  $61\,500/(1.1\times37\,000) = 1.511$ , and hence is allocated 2 seats.

Thus a bi-proportional apportionment method operates such that rows and columns are re-scaled to obtain corrected weights which, when rounded, exhaust the pre-specified district magnitudes and overall party seats. That this approach yields a unique solution (except for ties) is proved in [2]. Not

Overall party seats	PSOE	PP	CHA	District
District magnitudes	6	5	2	divisors
Huesca 3	61 500-2	50 493-1	8 629-0	37000
Teruel 3	36 152-1	35 920-2	4 463-0	23 000
Zaragoza 7	224 776-3	198 480-2	81 160-2	80 000
Party divisors	1.1	1	0.6	

Table 7: Biproportional apportionment, for the data from Table 2. With the divisors displayed in the margins, the apportionment is easy to verify. For instance, PSOE in Huesca gets 2 seats since  $61\,500/(1.1\times37\,000)=1.511$ .

surprisingly, the approach also works when standard rounding is re-placed by rounding down (Jefferson/D'Hondt/Hagenbach-Bischoff), or by rounding up (Adams). In the Swiss Canton of Zurich the bi-proportional method with standard rounding was made part of the electoral law, and has been successfully applied in the City of Zurich in 2006, and in the Canton of Zurich in 2007 [8]. The Swiss Cantons of Aargau and Schaffhausen have adopted initiatives to also incorporate the method into their electoral laws. An application of the bi-proportional method to Mexican elections is discussed in [4, 5, 6], to Italien elections in [11], to elections in the Färöer Islands in [12].

## 3 The 2004 election to the Spanish Congress.

We now apply the bi-proportional divisor method with rounding down (Jefferson/D'Hondt/Hagenbach-Bischoff) to the election of the Spanish Congress in March 2004. There are 52 electoral districts (circumscriptions), the 50 provinces plus the autonomic cities of Ceuta and Melilla. The Spanish Congress comprises 350 seats. The district magnitudes used are those from the 2004 election.

The first step is to obtain the overall party seats, across all of Spain, irrespective of the subdivision into the electoral districts. Table 8 shows the 20 parties that each received more than 30 000 nationwide votes, and their vote counts. The apportionment of the 350 congressional seats proportionally to these vote counts results in the columns labelled

• "Sainte-Laguë" when the divisor method with standard rounding (Webster/Sainte-Laguë) is used,

- "D'Hondt" when the divisor method with rounding down (Jefferson/D'Hondt/Hagenbach-Bischoff) is used, and
- "Current" when the apportionment from the 2004 electoral law is used.

The total number of all valid votes, including those of over seventy minor parties not listed in Table 8, was 25 483 504. Note that party PAR with 36 540 votes represents less than 0.2 percent of all valid votes. On the other hand, a nationwide five percent threshold as in Germany would exclude all parties with fewer than 1 274 176 votes, and thus leave only the first three top runners. Rather than entering into a discussion which apportionment would result from a five, four, three, etc. percent threshold, we rely in the sequel on the divisor method with rounding down (Jefferson/D'Hondt/Hagenbach-Bischoff) which comes closest to the current results that are entailed by the pertinent electoral law. For the sake of demonstration, we then also use this method for the bi-proportional calculations.

In Table 8 we can compare the total number of seats the parties receive under D'Hondt with the number of seats they currently have. In any case, the PSOE is the party that obtains the plurality of seats. In order to build an absolute majority, it would need the support of other parties. In the current allotment, the support of any two parties amongst IU, CiU, ERC or PNV produce a majority. With D'Hondt, the support of IU would suffice.

The D'Hondt apportionment, though close to the current apportionment, is seen to be much more concordant with the actual vote counts. IU wins about twice as many votes as ERC, and is allocated twice as many seats. In contrast, the current allocation gives IU fewer seats than ERC. PA wins twice as many votes as CHA and D'Hondt allocates two seats as compared to one. The current law denies PA any representation in Congress, yet rewards CHA with one seat.

The bi-proportional divisor method with rounding down yields the seat numbers as shown in Table 9. For this data set, with 52 rows and 11 columns, five row scalings and four column scalings are needed to obtain the result.

Party	Votes	Sainte-	D'Hondt	Current
		Laguë		
PSOE	11 026 163	152	158	164
PP	9 763 144	135	139	148
IU	1284081	18	18	5
CiU	835 471	12	11	10
ERC	652 196	9	9	8
PNV	420 980	6	6	7
CC	235 221	3	3	3
BNG	208 688	3	2	2
PA	181 868	3	2	0
CHA	94 252	1	1	1
EA	80 905	1	1	1
NA-BAI	61 045	1	0	1
EV	40 759	1	0	0
PSM	40 289	1	0	0
CENB	40 208	1	0	0
ARALAR	38 560	1	0	0
LV-E	37 499	1	0	0
PAR	36 540	1	0	0
CDS	34 101	0	0	0
EV-AE	30528	0	0	0
Total	25142498	350	350	350
Divisors		72400	69 760	

Table 8: Seat apportionments for the 2004 Spanish Congress, based on the nationwide vote totals. For the Sainte-Laguë apportionment, the votes are divided by 72 400 and the resulting quotients are rounded in a standard fashion to obtain the seat numbers shown. For the D'Hondt apportionment, the divisor is 69 760 and all quotients get truncated to their integer parts. The D'Hondt method comes closest to the current electoral law, whence this method is also used in the biproportional apportionment in Table 9.

A Coruña 9 287 324-4 329 389-4 14125-0 566 459-1 70000 Alava 4 108715-2 110 338-2 9145-0 40001; \$7 838-0 27 880 Albacete 4 108715-2 110 338-2 9145-0 60001; \$7 838-0 27 880 Albacete 11 374 631-5 434 812-6 34774-0 65000 Alicaria 5 145 868-3 135 434-2 9522-0 67 190-0 65000 Asturias 8 305 240-4 307 977-3 59 253-1 7,000 Asturias 8 305 240-4 307 977-3 59 253-1 7,000 Asturias 6 219 172-3 176 699-3 15589-0 30 000 Barcelona 31 1268 028-12 485 504-4 198 116-4 1586 854-6; \$248 986-5 97000 Barcelona 31 1268 028-12 124 15-5 10-1 1586 854-6; \$248 986-5 97000 Barcelona 31 1268 028-12 122 415-2 7703-0 1586 854-6; \$248 986-5 97000 Barcelona 31 1268 028-12 124 15-2 7703-0 1586 854-6; \$248 986-5 97000 Cácres 4 137 654-2 118 627-2 7569-0 5000 Cácres 4 137 654-2 18 1627-2 7569-0 5000 Cácres 5 149 906-2 190 383-3 12 146-0 50000 Castellón 5 139 236-3 142 462-2 10 322-0 46000 Castellón 5 139 236-3 142 462-2 10 322-0 46000 Castellón 1 12 769-0 21 142-1 218-0 20000 Ciudad Real 5 147 271-3 142 508-2 8581-0 70000 Ciudad Real 5 147 271-3 142 508-2 8581-0 9000 Ciudad Real 6 113 089-2 40 9059-0 15 070-0 196 928-2; \$23 482-2 40 0000 Ciudad Real 7 246 324-4 166 665 5-2 47 908-1 619 648-0 60 000 Ciudad Real 7 268 870-4 193 484-2 31 227-1 5140 300-0 61 200 Ciudada 7 268 870-4 193 484-2 31 227-1 5140 300-0 61 200 Ciudada 7 268 870-4 193 484-2 31 227-1 5140 300-0 61 200 Ciudada 8 8 167 926-3 28 948-1 28 668-1 315 402-2; \$24 971-1 50 000 Ciudada 8 8 167 926-3 29 595-1 5070-0 196 928-2; \$23 921-1 50 000 Ciudada 8 8 167 926-3 29 5095-4 98 76-0 48 94 20-1 45 000 Ciudada 8 148 1390-2 50 943-1 3650-0 78 629-0 30 000 Ciudada 8 148 1390-2 50 940-1 28 668-1 315 402-2; \$24 971-1 50 000 Ciudada 8 148 1390-2 12 13 986-2 25 100-0 168 735-2; \$25 101-1 35 000 Ciudada 8 167 926-3 28 936-4 98 76-0 48 94 20-1 45 000 Ciudada 8 169 926-2 12 93 96-2 12 95 96-0 168 735-2; \$25 101-1 35 000 Ciudada 8 169 926-2 12 93 96-2 12 95 96-0 168 735-2; \$25 101-1 35 000 Ciudada 8 169 926-2 12 93 96-2 12 95 96-0 168 735-2; \$25 101-1 35 000 Ciudada 8 169 926-2 12 926-2 12 95 96-0 148	Province/City	350	PSOE-158	PP-139	IU-18	Others-35	Dist.div
Alicante 11 374631-5 434812-6 34774-0 68500 Alimería 5 145868-3 135434-2 9522-0 67190-0 68500 Alturias 8 305240-4 307977-3 59253-1 7,000 Asturias 8 305240-4 307977-3 59253-1 7,000 Avila 3 38640-1 67622-2 3598-0 30000 Badajoz 6 219172-3 176693-3 16589-0 55000 Barcelona 31 1268028-12 485504-4 198116-4 1586854-6; 428986-5 97000 Barcelona 31 1268028-12 485504-4 198116-4 1586854-6; 428986-5 97000 Cácreres 4 91727-2 122415-2 7703-0 66662-6 49906-2 16662-6 19906-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 6662-6 19906-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 6662-6 19906-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 69006-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 69006-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 69006-2 19938-3 12146-0 6660-2 19938-2 1993		9	287 324-4	329 389-4	14 125-0	<sup>5</sup> 86 459-1	70 000
Alicante 11 374631-5 434812-6 34774-0 68500 Alimería 5 145868-3 135434-2 9522-0 67190-0 68500 Alturias 8 305240-4 307977-3 59253-1 7,000 Asturias 8 305240-4 307977-3 59253-1 7,000 Avila 3 38640-1 67622-2 3598-0 30000 Badajoz 6 219172-3 176693-3 16589-0 55000 Barcelona 31 1268028-12 485504-4 198116-4 1586854-6; 428986-5 97000 Barcelona 31 1268028-12 485504-4 198116-4 1586854-6; 428986-5 97000 Cácreres 4 91727-2 122415-2 7703-0 66662-6 49906-2 16662-6 19906-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 6662-6 19906-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 6662-6 19906-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 69006-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 69006-2 19938-3 12146-0 6662-6 69006-2 19938-3 12146-0 6660-2 19938-2 1993	Álava	4	561 374-1	48 992-1	14 181-1	<sup>3</sup> 47 090-1: <sup>8</sup> 7 838-0	27880
Alicante         11         374 631-5         434 812-6         34774-0         68 500         45 000           Almería         5         145 868-3         135 434-2         9522-0         67 190-0         45 000           Asturias         8         305 240-4         307 977-3         59 255-1         77 190-0         45 000           Avila         3         38 640-1         67 622-2         35 98-0         9000         55 000           Barcelona         31         1268 028-12         485 504-4         198 116-4         1586 854-6; 428 986-5         97 000           Burgos         4         91 727-2         122 415-2         77 69-0         50 000         60 000           Cácres         4         137 654-2         118 627-2         7 569-0         50 000         50 000           Cádiz         9         326 152-4         216 416-3         38 6611-1         63 359-1         50 000           Cádiz         9         326 152-4         216 416-3         38 6611-1         63 359-1         50 000           Castellón         5         139 236-3         142 462-2         10 32-0         46 000           Cuatal         1         12 769-0         21 42-1         218-0         20 0		4		I			
Almería	Alicante	11		434 812-6			<u> </u>
Asturias         8         305 240-4         307 977-3         59 253-1         74 900           Ávila         3         38 640-1         67 622-2         3598-0         30 900           Barcelona         31         1268 028-12         485 504-4         198 116-4         156 6854-6; 2428 986-5         97 000           Burgos         4         91 727-2         122 415-2         77 03-0         66 26 24 28 986-5         97 000           Cácires         4         137 654-2         118 627-2         7 569-0         50 000           Cádiz         9         326 152-4         21 64 16-3         38 611-1         53 592-1         50 000           Cateres         4         137 654-2         118 627-2         7 569-0         50 000         60 000           Catelá         5         149 900-2         190 383-3         12 146-0         50 000         60 000           Castellón         5         139 236-3         142 462-2         10 322-0         46 000         60           Catellón         7         246 324-4         166 665-2         47 908-1         619 648-0         60 00         60         600         600         600         600         600         600         600         600						<sup>6</sup> 7 190-0	
Aviila	Asturias						
Badajoz         6         219172-3         176699-3         16889-0         55000           Barcelona         31         1268028-12         485504-4         198116-4         1568554-6; 2428986-5         97000           Burgos         4         91727-2         122415-2         7703-0         568554-6; 2428986-5         97000           Cáceres         4         137654-2         118627-2         7569-0         50000           Cádiz         9         326152-4         216416-3         38611-1         633592-1         55000           Cantabria         5         14996-2         199383-3         12146-0         5000         2000           Castellón         5         139236-3         142462-2         10322-0         46000           Cudad Real         5         147271-3         142508-2         8581-0         2000           Cidodo         7         246324-4         166665-2         47908-1         6610-0           Cidrada Real         7         268870-4         193484-2         3127-1         614030-0         6000           Girona         6         113089-2         40959-0         15070-0         196928-2; 28348-2         40000           Granada         7 <t< td=""><td></td><td>3</td><td></td><td></td><td>3 598-0</td><td></td><td></td></t<>		3			3 598-0		
Barcelona   31		_	1				l
Burgos		_				<sup>1</sup> 586 854-6: <sup>2</sup> 428 986-5	
Cáceres         4         137654-2         118627-2         7569-0         63359-1         50000           Cádiz         9         326152-4         216416-3         38611-1         63359-1         65000           Cantabria         5         14996-2         190838-3         12146-0         50000           Castellón         5         139236-3         142462-2         10322-0         46000           Ceuta         1         12769-0         21142-1         218-0         20000           Ciudad Real         5         147271-3         142508-2         8581-0         47000           Córdoba         7         246324-4         166655-2         47908-1         619648-0         60 00           Cúrdoba         7         246324-4         166655-2         3258-0         31000         60 00           Girona         6         113089-2         40995-0         15070-0         196928-2; 28482-2         4000           Guadalajara         3         52915-1         57078-2         5310-0         196928-2; 28482-2         4000           Guadalajara         3         52915-1         57078-2         5310-0         196928-2; 28482-2         4000           Guipixcoa         6						3000010, 1200000	
Cádiz         9         3261524         216416-3         38611-1         633592-1         65000           Cantabria         5         149966-2         190383-3         12146-0         50000         50000           Castellón         5         139236-3         142462-2         10322-0         46000           Ceuta         1         12769-0         21142-1         218-0         2000           Ciudad Real         5         147271-3         142508-2         8581-0         47000           Córdoba         7         246324-4         16665-2         47908-1         619648-0         60000           Cuenca         3         60697-1         666515-2         3258-0         31000           Girona         6         113089-2         40959-0         15070-0         196928-2; 28348-2         2000           Granada         7         268870-4         193484-2         31227-1         614030-0         62600           Guadalajara         3         52915-1         57078-2         5310-0         96928-2; 28482-2         4000           Guipúzcoa         6         9810-1         56904-1         28668-1         3115402-2; 842971-1         50000           Huelva         5	9						
Cantabria         5         149 906-2         190 383-3         12 146-0         50 000           Castellón         5         139 236-3         142 462-2         10 322-0         46 000           Ceuta         1         12 769-0         21 142-1         218-0         20 000           Ciudad Real         5         147 271-3         142 508-2         8 581-0         47 000           Córdoba         7         246 324-4         166 665-2         47 908-1         619 648-0         60 000           Cuenca         3         60 697-1         66515-2         32 58-0         31 000           Girona         6         113 089-2         40 959-0         15 070-0         196 928-2; 28 3482-2         40 000           Granada         7         268 870-4         193 484-2         31 227-1         61 4030-0         126 600           Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3115 402-2; 842 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 097-0         61 45 42-0         39 000           I. Baleares         8         185 623-4         215 737-4         43 000         44 81 390-2         24 483-0         615 493-0						<sup>6</sup> 33 592-1	
Castellón         5         139 236-3         142 462-2         10 322-0         46 000           Ceuta         1         12 769-0         21 142-1         218-0         20 000           Ciudad Real         5         147 271-3         142 508-2         8 581-0         47 000           Córdoba         7         246 324-4         166 665-2         47 908-1         619 648-0         60 000           Girona         6         113 089-2         40 959-0         15 070-0         196 928-2; *28 482-2         40 000           Granada         7         268 870-4         193 484-2         31 227-1         614 030-0         61 200           Guadalajara         3         52 915-1         570 78-2         5310-0         26 600         26 600           Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3115 402-2; *82 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15097-0         614 542-0         39 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15097-0         614 542-0         39 000           I. Baleares         8         185 623-4         215 737-4         150 70         49 20         43 000			1			00 002 1	l
Ceuta         1         12769-0         21142-1         218-0         20000           Ciudad Real         5         147271-3         142508-2         8581-0         47000           Córdoba         7         246324-4         166665-2         47908-1         619648-0         60000           Cuenca         3         66067-1         66515-2         3258-0         196928-2; 283482-2         40000           Girona         6         113089-2         40959-0         15070-0         196928-2; 283482-2         40000           Granada         7         268870-4         193484-2         31227-1         614030-0         61200           Guadalajara         3         52915-1         57078-2         5310-0         614030-0         61200           Guipázoa         6         98100-1         56904-1         28668-1         3115402-2; \$42971-1         50000           Huelva         5         154579-3         84173-2         15097-0         614542-0         39000           Huelva         5         154579-3         84173-2         15097-0         614549-0         30000           Lasace         8         185623-4         215737-4         4280-0         51549-0         3000		-					
Ciudad Real         5         147 271-3         142 508-2         8 581-0         47 000           Córdoba         7         246 324-4         166 665-2         47 908-1         619 648-0         60 000           Guenca         3         66 697-1         66 515-2         3 258-0         31 000           Girona         6         113 089-2         40 959-0         15 070-0         196 928-2; 283 482-2         40 000           Granada         7         268 870-4         193 484-2         31 227-1         614 030-0         61 200           Guadalajara         3         52 915-1         570 78-2         5 310-0         26 600         36 600           Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3115 402-2; 842 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 097-0         614 542-0         39 000           Huesca         3         61 502-3         29 341-2         15 15-0         66 228 611-4         143 288-2         24 483-0         615 493-0         50 000           La Rioja         4         81 390-2         92 441-2         5115-0         30 000         30 000           La Kioja         4         81 3							· ·
Córdoba         7         246 324-4         166 665-2         47 908-1         619 648-0         60 000           Cuenca         3         60 697-1         66 515-2         3 258-0         31 000           Girona         6         113 089-2         40 959-0         15 070-0         196 928-2; 283 482-2         40 000           Granada         7         268 870-4         193 484-2         31 227-1         614 030-0         61 200           Guadalajara         3         52 915-1         57 078-2         5 310-0         26 600           Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3115 402-2; 842 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 097-0         614 542-0         39 000           Huesca         3         61 500-2         50 493-1         3 650-0         78 629-0         30 000           I. Baleares         8         185 623-4         215 737-4         4         4 3000           La Rioja         4         81 390-2         92 441-2         5 115-0         48 9420-1         46 000           Las Palmas         8         167 926-3         208 995-4         9 876-0         48 9420-1         46 000							
Cuenca         3         60 697-1         66 515-2         3 258-0         916 928-2; 283 482-2         40 000           Girona         6         113 089-2         40 959-0         15 070-0         196 928-2; 283 482-2         40 000           Granada         7         268 870-4         193 484-2         31 227-1         614 030-0         61 200           Guadalajara         3         52 915-1         57 078-2         5 310-0         96 600         26 600           Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3115 402-2; 842 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 097-0         614 52-0         39 000           Huesca         3         61 500-2         50 493-1         3 650-0         78 629-0         30 000           I. Baleares         8         185 623-4         215 737-4						<sup>6</sup> 19.648-0	-
Girona 6 113 089-2 40 959-0 15 070-0 196 928-2; 283 482-2 40 000 Granada 7 268 870-4 193 484-2 31 227-1 614 030-0 61 200 Guadalajara 3 52 915-1 57 078-2 5310-0 266 60 Guipúzcoa 6 98 100-1 56904-1 28 668-1 3115 402-2; 842 971-1 50 000 Huelva 5 154 579-3 84 173-2 15 097-0 614 542-0 39 000 Huelva 5 154 579-3 84 173-2 15 097-0 614 542-0 39 000 Huesca 3 61 500-2 50 493-1 3650-0 78 629-0 30 000 Jaén 6 228 611-4 143 288-2 24 483-0 615 493-0 50 000 Jaén 6 228 611-4 143 288-2 24 483-0 615 493-0 50 000 Jaén 6 228 611-4 143 288-2 24 483-0 615 493-0 50 000 Jaén 6 228 611-4 143 288-2 24 483-0 615 493-0 50 000 Jaén 5 156 786-3 150 688-2 91 40-0 489 420-1 46 000 Jaén 5 156 786-3 150 688-2 7160-0 50 000 Jaén 5 156 786-3 150 688-2 7160-0 50 000 Jaén 4 68 971-1 34 116-0 69 10-0 168 735-2; 25 0 104-1 35 000 Jaga 10 367 788-5 269 063-4 47 182-1 632 368-0 63 000 Maliaga 10 367 788-5 269 063-4 47 182-1 632 368-0 63 000 Murcia 9 252 246-3 413 902-6 30 787-0 64 000 Jaen 5 13 000 Jaen 5 13 13 060 Jaen 6 13 13 060 Jaen 6 13 13 13 15 40 000 Jaen 6 13 13 13 15 14 676-1 156 158-3 18 399-0 60 00 Jaen 6 13 13 15 24 1 160 449-2 34 15-0 70 52 61 53-0 70 00 Jaen 6 13 13 15 24 1 160 449-2 34 15-0 70 52 61 53-0 70 00 Jaen 6 13 660-3 39 79 15 25 00-0 52 61 53-0 70 00 Jaen 6 13 660-3 39 79 15 25 00-0 52 61 53-0 70 00 Jaen 6 13 660-3 39 79 15 25 00-2 34 70-0 52 61 53-0 70 00 Jaen 6 13 660-3 39 79 15 25 00-2 34 70-0 52 61 53-0 70 00 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 40 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 40 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000 Jaen 6 13 660-3 65 528-1 14 694-0 18 2954-1; 27 63 30-1 45 000				I		10 040-0	
Granada         7         268 870-4         193 484-2         31 227-1         614 030-0         61 200           Guadalajara         3         52 915-1         57078-2         5310-0         26 600           Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3115 402-2; 842 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 097-0         614 542-0         39 000           Huesca         3         61 500-2         50 493-1         3 650-0         78 629-0         30 000           L. Baleares         8         185 623-4         215 737-4         43 000         43 000           Jaén         6         228 611-4         143 288-2         24 483-0         615 493-0         50 000           La Rioja         4         81 390-2         92 441-2         5115-0         30 000         48 9420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         48 9420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         525 313-0         40 000           Luejo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         2570-0         525						196 928-2- 283 482-2	
Guadalajara         3         52 9 15-1         57 0 78-2         5 3 10-0         26 600           Guiptzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         3 115 402-2; 8 42 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 097-0         6 14 542-0         39 000           Huesca         3         61 500-2         50 493-1         3 650-0         78 629-0         30 000           I. Baleares         8         185 623-4         215 737-4         4         4 30 000           Jaén         6         228 611-4         143 288-2         24 483-0         6 15 493-0         50 000           La Rioja         4         81 390-2         92 441-2         5 115-0         489 420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           León         4         68 971-1         34 116-0         6910-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lugo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         25 70-0         52 53 13-0         40 000           Malaga         10         367 758-5         269 063-4         47 182-1							
Guipúzcoa         6         98 100-1         56904-1         28 668-1         315 402-2; 842 971-1         50 000           Huelva         5         154 579-3         84 173-2         15 997-0         \$14 542-0         39 000           Huesca         3         61 500-2         50 493-1         3 650-0         78 629-0         30 000           La Rioja         8         185 623-4         215 737-4         \$43 000         43 000           La Rioja         4         81 390-2         92 441-2         5 115-0         30 000           Las Palmas         8         167 926-3         208 995-4         9 876-0         48 9420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         50 000         50 000           Leida         4         68 971-1         34 116-0         6 910-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lugo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         25 70-0         525 313-0         40 000           Madrid         35         1544 676-16         15 76 636-15         225 109-4         63 23 68-0         63 000           Melilla         1         11 273-0         14 856-1         229-0         13 000						14 030-0	
Huelva	· ·	_				3115402-2·842971-1	
Huesca   3	•						
I. Baleares							
Jaén         6         228 611-4         143 288-2         24 483-0         6 15 493-0         50 000           Las Palmas         8         167 926-3         208 995-4         9 876-0         489 420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         50 000           Leida         4         68 971-1         34116-0         6 910-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lugo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         25 70-0         525 313-0         40 000           Madrid         35         1544 676-16         1576 636-15         225 109-4         95 000           Málaga         10         367 758-5         269 063-4         47 182-1         632 368-0         63 000           Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3415-0         27000         2000           Salamanca					3 030-0	0 023-0	
La Rioja         4         81 390-2         92 441-2         5 115-0         489 420-1         46 000           Las Palmas         8         167 926-3         208 995-4         9 876-0         489 420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         50 000           Lleida         4         68 971-1         34 116-0         6 910-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lugo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         2 570-0         525 313-0         40 000           Madrid         35         1544 676-16         1576 636-15         225 109-4         95 000           Malaga         10         367 758-5         269 063-4         47 182-1         63 2368-0         63 000           Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51824-1         60 449-2         3415-0         27000           Salamanca         4 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>24.483-0</td> <td>615.403-0</td> <td></td>					24.483-0	615.403-0	
Las Palmas         8         167 926-3         208 995-4         9 876-0         489 420-1         46 000           León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         50 000         50 000           Lleida         4         68 971-1         34 116-0         6 910-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lugo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         2 570-0         525 313-0         40 000           Madrid         35         1544 676-16         1576 636-15         225 109-4         632 368-0         63 000           Málaga         10         367 758-5         269 063-4         47 182-1         632 368-0         63 000           Melilla         1         112 73-0         14 856-1         229-0         13 000           Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2 055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         34 15-0         270 000         270 000						10 400-0	
León         5         156 786-3         150 688-2         7 160-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lleida         4         68 971-1         34 116-0         6 910-0         168 735-2; 250 104-1         35 000           Lugo         4         92 708-2         123 986-2         2 570-0         525 313-0         40 000           Madrid         35         1544 676-16         1 576 636-15         225 109-4         95 000           Malaga         10         367 758-5         269 063-4         47 182-1         632 368-0         63 000           Melilla         1         11 273-0         14 856-1         229-0         13 000           Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27 000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Sta. C. Tenerife<	0					489.420-1	
Lleida         4         68971-1         34116-0         6910-0         ¹68735-2; ²50104-1         35000           Lugo         4         92708-2         123986-2         2570-0         ⁵25313-0         40000           Madrid         35         1544676-16         1576636-15         225109-4         632368-0         63000           Melilla         1         11273-0         14856-1         229-0         13000           Murcia         9         252246-3         413902-6         30787-0         64000           Navarra         5         113906-2         127653-3         19899-0         40000           Ourense         4         74636-1         132631-3         2055-0         ⁵26153-0         40000           Palencia         3         51824-1         60449-2         3415-0         27000           Pontevedra         7         228016-3         279454-3         13158-0         ⁵70763-1         70000           Salamanca         4         94655-2         128932-2         4713-0         4145801-2         50000           Segovia         3         39976-1         52500-2         3470-0         20000           Sevilla         12         639293-7         30646						03 420-1	
Lugo         4         92708-2         123986-2         2570-0         525313-0         40000           Madrid         35         1544676-16         1576636-15         225109-4         95000           Málaga         10         367758-5         269063-4         47182-1         632368-0         63000           Melilla         1         11273-0         14856-1         229-0         13000           Murcia         9         252246-3         413902-6         30787-0         64,000           Navarra         5         113906-2         127653-3         19899-0         40000           Ourense         4         74636-1         132631-3         2055-0         526153-0         40000           Palencia         3         51824-1         60449-2         3415-0         570763-1         70000           Pontevedra         7         228016-3         279454-3         13158-0         570763-1         70000           Salamanca         4         94655-2         128932-2         4713-0         4445801-2         5000           Segovia         3         39976-1         52500-2         3470-0         20000           Sevilla         12         639293-7         306464-3 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td><sup>1</sup>68 735-2: <sup>2</sup>50 104-1</td> <td></td>						<sup>1</sup> 68 735-2: <sup>2</sup> 50 104-1	
Madrid         35         1544676-16         1576636-15         225 109-4         95 000           Málaga         10         367758-5         269 063-4         47 182-1         632 368-0         63 000           Melilla         1         11273-0         14 856-1         229-0         13 000           Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27 000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4713-0         44 000         44 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 00           Soria         3 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>							
Málaga         10         367758-5         269063-4         47182-1         632368-0         63000           Melilla         1         11273-0         14856-1         229-0         13000           Murcia         9         252246-3         413902-6         30787-0         64000           Navarra         5         113906-2         127653-3         19899-0         40000           Ourense         4         74636-1         132631-3         2055-0         526153-0         40000           Palencia         3         51824-1         60449-2         3415-0         27000           Pontevedra         7         228016-3         279454-3         13158-0         570763-1         70000           Salamanca         4         94655-2         128932-2         4713-0         44000         44000           Segovia         3         39976-1         52500-2         3470-0         20000         20000           Sevilla         12         639293-7         306464-3         73344-1         645005-1         80000           Soria         3         22287-1         29187-2         1230-0         12000         12000           Tarragona         6         13660-3 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>20010-0</td><td></td></td<>						20010-0	
Melilla         1         11273-0         14856-1         229-0         13 000           Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2 055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27 000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 00           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1						632368-0	
Murcia         9         252 246-3         413 902-6         30 787-0         64 000           Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2 055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27 000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Toledo						92 900-0	
Navarra         5         113 906-2         127 653-3         19 899-0         40 000           Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2 055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27 000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         25 14-0         74 463-0         17 000           Valencia							
Ourense         4         74 636-1         132 631-3         2 055-0         526 153-0         40 000           Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27 000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>							
Palencia         3         51 824-1         60 449-2         3 415-0         27000           Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valadolid         5						<sup>5</sup> 26 153-0	
Pontevedra         7         228 016-3         279 454-3         13 158-0         570 763-1         70 000           Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9						201000	
Salamanca         4         94 655-2         128 932-2         4 713-0         44 000           Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3<						<sup>5</sup> 70 763-1	
Sta. C. Tenerife         7         165 158-3         133 677-2         8 736-0         4145 801-2         50 000           Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3375-0         781 160-1         60 000				I		101001	
Segovia         3         39 976-1         52 500-2         3 470-0         20 000           Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         781 160-1         60 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000						<sup>4</sup> 145 801-2	
Sevilla         12         639 293-7         306 464-3         73 344-1         645 005-1         80 000           Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         781 160-1         60 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000						110 001 2	
Soria         3         22 287-1         29 187-2         1 230-0         12 000           Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         781 160-1         60 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000				I		<sup>6</sup> 45 005-1	
Tarragona         6         136 660-3         65 528-1         14 694-0         182 954-1; 276 330-1         45 000           Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         781 160-1         60 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000						10 000 1	
Teruel         3         36 152-2         35 920-1         2 514-0         74 463-0         17 000           Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         781 160-1         60 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000						<sup>1</sup> 82,954-1: <sup>2</sup> 76,330-1	
Toledo         5         167 807-3         171 325-2         12 707-0         55 000           Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         30 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000							
Valencia         16         613 833-7         665 526-8         78 515-1         78 000           Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         30 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000						1 100 0	
Valladolid         5         155 401-3         163 009-2         13 029-0         51 420           Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         30 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000							
Vizcaya         9         185 514-3         129 889-2         59 493-1         3258 488-3; 830 096-0         60 000           Zamora         3         53 757-1         71 821-2         3 375-0         30 000           Zaragoza         7         224 776-3         198 480-3         15 672-0         781 160-1         60 000							
Zamora         3         53757-1         71821-2         3375-0         30 000           Zaragoza         7         224776-3         198480-3         15672-0         781160-1         60 000						<sup>3</sup> 258 488-3: <sup>8</sup> 30 096-0	
Zaragoza 7 224 776-3 198 480-3 15 672-0 781 160-1 60 000	V					200 100 0, 00 000-0	
9						<sup>7</sup> 81 160-1	
	Party divisors	<u> </u>	1.007	1.05705	0.5084	011001	

Table 9: The biproportional divisor method with rounding down (Jefferson/D'Hondt/Hagenbach-Bischoff), applied to the March 2004 election of the Spanish Congress. To obtain the seats for a party in a Province, the votes are divided by the corresponding party and district divisors, and the resulting quotient is truncated to its integer part. The column "Others" refers to the smaller parties as enumerated in the main text.

The three largest parties, PSOE, PP, and IU, campaign in all districts. It so happens that no district features more than two other parties. These other parties, whose national totals range from about 800000 (CiU) down to 80000 (EA), are compactly displayed in just one column where a superscript number indicate their identity, as follows:

- 1. CiU in Catalunya (Barcelona, Girona, Lleida and Tarragona) has party divisor 0.97;
- 2. ERC in Catalunya has party divisor 0.87;
- 3. PNV in the Basque Country (Álava, Guipúzcoa and Vizcaya) has party divisor 1.1;
- 4. CC on the Canary Islands has party divisor 1.2;
- 5. BNG in Galicia (A Coruña, Lugo, Ourense and Pontevedra) has party divisor 1;
- PA in Andalucía (Almería, Cádiz, Córdoba, Granada, Huelva, Jaén, Málaga and Sevilla) has party divisor 0.515;
- 7. CHA in Aragón (Huesca, Teruel and Zaragoza) has party divisor 1; and
- 8. EA in the Basque Country has party divisor 0.7.

A peculiar effect of any bi-proportional apportionment is the possible occurrence of discordant seat assignments. By definition, we speak of a discordant seat assignment in two cells of Table 9 whenever one cell features more votes but fewer seats than the other. This is particularly irritating within the same district. In the current system seats are assigned just within that district and with no regard to the rest of the nation, which makes discordant seat assignments within districts impossible. (But the current system has to pay its price. Securing more homogeneity within districts aggravates the heterogeneity between districts, and on a national level.)

Here are some examples. In Asturias, PSOE is weaker than PP (305 240: 307 977), but wins more seats (4:3). Other discordant seat assignments between PSOE and PP occur in Castellón, Madrid, Toledo, and Valadolid. Within the PSOE party, a discordant seat assignment occurs between A Coruña and Álava (287 324: 561 374 votes versus 4:1 seats).

Such frictions are unavoidable since a bi-proportional apportionment mediates between two goals that, at times, are conflicting. One goal is to achieve proportionality as pre-specified by the district magnitudes, the other, proportionality as pre-specified by the overall party seats. Since the turn-out in the 52 districts is not identical, and hence creates different proportional weightings than those based on the population and the district magnitudes, global balance cannot be achieved without local adjustments. In fact, it is this global view that represents the distinguished meritorious feature of a bi-proportional method. The method achieves proportionality among electoral districts, relative to population counts, as well as proportionality among parties, relative to vote counts. As such it brings about a "nationalization" of the electoral process for the major national institution, the Congress.

### 4 Conclusions.

The bi-proportional method is a new recent technique to solve a proportional representation problem that comes in a rectangular table of data, imposing restrictions in the direction of rows as well as in the direction of columns. For the application to political elections, the table is made up of the vote counts that various political parties receive in a number of electoral districts. The restrictions are the district magnitudes, and the overall party seats.

Usually the district magnitudes are determined in the middle of a legislative period, proportionally to the populations census data supplied by the statistical offices. In contrast, the overall party seats are calculated at the eve of election day, proportionally to the nationwide vote totals of the parties. This "super-apportionment" honors the popular vote irrespective of the subdivision into various districts. This guarantees that all voters contribute to the final result in an equal manner, without being advantaged or disadvantaged when casting their vote in a small, rural district or in a large, municipal district.

The bi-proportional method then proceeds to a sub-apportionment to obtain the number of seats of parties per districts. The principle of proportional representation persists, in that the results within a district are scaled by a common factor, the district divisor, as well as that the results within a party are scaled by a common divisor, the party divisor. However, since the method serves two goals, as dictated by district magnitudes and overall party seats, the interaction of the two sets of divisors is occasionally counter-intuitive.

The high degree of proportionality that is thus achieved on a national level would suggest to introduce a threshold of a minimum vote percentage before a party becomes eligible to participate in the apportionment process. Otherwise, since all votes contribute towards the final result, parties are well advised to adopt strategies of presenting themselves in all electoral districts. Therefore a bi-proportional method induces a "nationalization" of the election of a national political body such as the Congress.

A computer is needed to calculate a bi-proportional seat apportionment. However, once the final result is made public, verification is much easier than it used to be with the old system. All a voter has to do is to take the vote count of his or her party in his or her district, and divide it by the divisors that are published with the final apportionment. The increased transparency for the individual citizen goes along well with the increased equality on a national level [13].

### Acknowledgements.

Authors wish to thank the Spanish Ministry of Education and Science and the FEDER for co-financing the Project SEC2001-3117. We also would like to thank the Andalusia Government for supporting the research group FQM191 and the Project FQM-01969, that permits to pay the expenses of our research on proportional representation and social election.

### References

- [1] Balinski, M. L., Young, H. P. Fair Representation: Meeting the Ideal of One Man One Vote. New Haven, CT, 1982.
- [2] Balinski, M. L., Demange, G. An Axiomatic approach to proportionality between matrices. *Mathematics of Operations Research* 14, 700–719, 1989.
- [3] Balinski, M. L., Demange, G. Algorithms for proportional matrices in reals and integers. *Mathematical Programming*, 45, 193–210, 1989.
- [4] Balinski, M. L., Ramírez, V. A case study of electoral manipulation: The Mexican laws of 1989 and 1994. Electoral Studies 15, 203–217, 1996.

- [5] Balinski, M. L., Ramírez, V. Mexican electoral law: 1996 version. *Electoral Studies* 16, 329–340, 1997.
- [6] Balinski, M. L., Ramírez, V. Mexico's 1997 apportionment defies its electoral law. *Electoral Studies* 18, 117–124, 1999.
- [7] Márquez, M.L., Ramírez, V. The Spanish electoral system: Proportionality and governability. *Annals of Operation Research*, ???, 45–59, 1998.
- [8] Pukelsheim, F., Schuhmacher, Ch. Das neue Zürcher Zuteilungsverfahren für Parlamentswahlen., Aktuelle Juristische Praxis Pratique Juridique Actuelle 5, 505–522, 2004.
- [9] Maier, S., Pukelsheim, F. BAZI: A free computer program for proportional representation apportionment. Universität Augsburg, Institut für Mathematik, Preprint 42/2007. www.opus-bayern.de/uni-augsburg/volltexte/2007/711/
- [10] Shugart, M.S., Wattenberg, M.P., Mixed-Member Electoral Systems The Best of Both Worlds? Oxford, 2001.
- [11] Pennisi, A. The Italian bug: A flawed procedure for bi-proportional seat allocation. Pages 151–166 in: *Mathematics and Democracy Recent Advances in Voting Systems and Collective Choice*. Editors B. Simeone / F. Pukelsheim. Berlin, 2006.
- [12] Zachariasen, P., Zachariasen, M. A comparison of electoral formulae for the Faroese Parliament. Pages 235–252 in: *Mathematics and Democracy* – *Recent Advances in Voting Systems and Collective Choice*. Editors B. Simeone / F. Pukelsheim. Berlin, 2006.
- [13] Pukelsheim, F. Current issues of apportionment problems. Pages 167–176 in: *Mathematics and Democracy Recent Advances in Voting Systems and Collective Choice*. Editors B. Simeone / F. Pukelsheim. Berlin, 2006.